

350 Fifth Avenue, 34<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10118-3299  
Tel: 212-290-4700  
Fax: 212-736-1300 ; 917-591-3452

HUMAN  
RIGHTS  
WATCH

#### US PROGRAM

Sara Darehshori, *Senior Counsel*  
Jamie Fellner, *Senior Advisor*  
Antonio Ginatta, *Advocacy Director*  
Ian Kysel, *Aryeh Neier Fellow*  
Adam Lewis, *Associate*  
Maria McFarland, *Deputy Director*  
Grace Meng, *Researcher*  
Alba Morales, *Researcher*  
Alison Parker, *Director*  
Laura Pitter, *Counterterrorism Advisor*  
Nicole Pittman, *Soros Justice Fellow*  
Andrea Prasow, *Senior Counterterrorism Counsel*  
Samantha Reiser, *Associate*  
Brian Root, *Quantitative Analyst*  
Ricardo Sandoval Palos, *Researcher*  
Elena Vanko, *Associate*

#### HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH

Kenneth Roth, *Executive Director*  
Michele Alexander, *Deputy Executive Director, Development and Global Initiatives*  
Carroll Bogert, *Deputy Executive Director, External Relations*  
Jan Egeland, *Europe Director and Deputy Executive Director*  
Iain Levine, *Deputy Executive Director, Program*  
Chuck Lustig, *Deputy Executive Director, Operations*

Walid Ayoub, *Information Technology Director*  
Emma Daly, *Communications Director*  
Barbara Guglielmo, *Finance and Administration Director*  
Peggy Hicks, *Global Advocacy Director*  
Babatunde Olugboji, *Deputy Program Director*  
Dinah Pokempner, *General Counsel*  
Tom Porteous, *Deputy Program Director*  
James Ross, *Legal & Policy Director*  
Joe Saunders, *Deputy Program Director*  
Frances Sinha, *Human Resources Director*  
James F. Hoge, Jr., *Chair*

#### BOARD OF DIRECTORS

James F. Hoge, Jr., *Chair*  
Susan Manilow, *Vice-Chair*  
Joel Motley, *Vice-Chair*  
Sid Sheinberg, *Vice-Chair*  
John J. Studzinski, *Vice-Chair*  
Hassan Elmasry, *Treasurer*  
Bruce Rabb, *Secretary*  
Karen Ackman  
Jorge Castañeda  
Tony Elliott  
Michael G. Fisch  
Michael E. Gellert  
Hina Jilani  
Betsy Karel  
Wendy Keys  
Robert Kissane  
Kimberly Marteau Emertson  
Oki Matsumoto  
Barry Meyer  
Aoife O'Brien  
Joan R. Platt  
Amy Rao  
Neil Rimer  
Victoria Riskin  
Amy L. Robbins  
Graham Robeson  
Shelley Rubin  
Kevin P. Ryan  
Ambassador Robin Sande-s  
Jean-Louis Servan-Schreiber  
Javier Solana  
Siri Stolt-Nielsen  
Darian W. Swig  
John R. Taylor  
Marie Warburg  
Catherine Zennström

November 19, 2012

Marlene H. Dortch  
Secretary  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 12<sup>th</sup> Street S.W.  
Washington, DC 20554

Re: CC Docket No. 96-128 ("Wright Petition") Alternative Rulemaking Proposal

Dear Secretary Dortch:

I write on behalf of Human Rights Watch to express our appreciation for the November 15, 2012 announcement of the Federal Communication Commission's (FCC) notice of proposed rulemaking on interstate phone call rules and rates. We also urge the FCC to continue to take action on CC Docket No. 96-128 (the "Wright Petition") and end the exorbitant rates now in effect in most states for prison phone calls.

As petitioners and the dozens of parties who have made *ex parte* submissions in this matter have amply explained, the current system of regulating calls to prisons, which allows states to receive kickbacks from telephone service providers in exchange for prison phone contracts, results in unfairly high phone rates for inmates and their families. In the 42 states that still allow commissions, or kickbacks, telephone rates for phone calls to prisoners currently range from \$10.00 to \$17.00 for a 15-minute call.

The high phone rates for calls from prisoners charged in most states exploit the vulnerability of inmates and their families, causing them severe harm. Approximately 2.7 million children in the US have at least one parent in prison. In addition to the prison walls themselves, many miles often separate inmates from their children. According to 2005 research by the Urban Institute, women in prisons are housed an average of 160 miles from their children, while men are housed an average of 100 miles from their children. Many inmates cannot count on their family members having the time and financial resources to make frequent visits. Being able to maintain regular phone contact is therefore vital for them to be able to maintain family ties. Prisoners

HRW.org

who, if able to obtain a paying job while incarcerated, make as little as \$.03 an hour simply cannot afford to help their families pay for expensive phone calls. As the *New York Times* pointed out in a September 23, 2012 editorial, inmates' families must often choose between communicating with their loved ones and "putting food on the table."

The main justification state officials cite for high phone rates is that providing phone service to inmates entails increased security costs. Yet 11 states that have banned or reduced kickbacks have seen their prison phone rates plummet and have reported no increased security breaches since doing so.

The result of the current exploitative phone system is to effectively cut families off from one another, undermining prisoners' and their relatives' human right to family unity. Inmates and their families pay in the emotional anguish resulting from being cut off from their support systems. Society at large also may pay in the higher rates of recidivism that result from the social isolation of inmates, as prisoners who lack community ties are more likely to reoffend when released from custody.

The Wright Petition has been pending since 2003. It is past time for the FCC to act on the Wright Petition and put an end to the unconscionable prison phone system currently in place.

Thank you for your consideration,



Maria McFarland  
Acting Director, US Program  
Human Rights Watch